

# Best of the Best

2004



Summaries of the Top Twenty Nominees for the  
Rosabeth Moss Kanter Award for Excellence in  
Work-Family Research

A partnership of  
The Center for Families at Purdue University  
The Boston College Center for Work & Family

SPONSORED BY





# Best of the Best

---

The 2004 Rosabeth Moss Kanter Award for Excellence  
in Work-Family Research

by Shelley M. MacDermid with

Gunnur Karakurt, Belinda Richardson, Kate Vaught, Abigail Tolhurst  
Christiansen, Chiung-Ya Tang, Mary K. Schultheis, Young In Kwon,  
and Rona Schwarz.

A partnership of

The Center for Families at Purdue University  
The Boston College Center for Work & Family  
Alliance for Work-Life Progress

*MacDermid, S. M., with Gunnur Karakurt, Belinda Richardson, Kate Vaught, Abigail Tolhurst Christiansen, Chiung-Ya Tang, Mary K. Schultheis, Young In Kwon, and Rona Schwarz. (2005). Best of the best: The 2004 Rosabeth Moss Kanter Award for excellence in work-family research. West Lafayette, IN: Center for Families at Purdue University.*

© 2005 *The Center for Families at Purdue University and The Boston College Center for Work & Family*

# Table of Contents

---

<b>Introduction</b> .....	5
<b>Rosabeth Moss Kanter: Biography</b> .....	6
<b>Excerpts from Work and Family in the United States</b> .....	7
<b>Commentary</b> .....	9
<b>The Winning Article: Author Biographies and Summary</b> .....	15
Mattingly & Bianchi	
<b>Summaries of Finalist Articles</b> .....	18
Bittman, England, Folbre, Sayer & Matheson	
Dominguez & Watkins	
Rogers & May	
Rothbard & Edwards	
<b>Summaries of the Remaining Articles in the Kanter Top 20</b> .....	23
Anderson, Binder & Krause	
Arthur	
Avellar & Smock	
Greenhaus, Collins & Shaw	
Grzywacz & Bass	
Haney & March	
Kelly	
Newman & Chin	
Ondrich, Spiess, Yang & Wagner	
Pratt & Rosa	
Stier & Lewin-Epstein	
Ward-Griffin & Marshall	
Williamson & McNamara	
Willson	
Wood, de Menezes & Lasaosa	
<b>Honorable Mention: First-Round Nominees</b> .....	39
<b>Award Procedures</b> .....	43
<b>Members of the Kanter Award Committee: 2004</b> .....	44
<b>Journals Reviewed</b> .....	45
<b>Award Partners</b> .....	46



## Introduction

---

Welcome to the 2004 volume of “Best of the Best.” This publication makes it possible for work-life practitioners to quickly become familiar with the best the world of scientific research has to offer them.

Over the past few decades there has been an explosion of research on the relationships between work and nonwork life. Researchers studying these issues come from many disciplines and professions, resulting in fragmented awareness of one another’s work. In addition, exchanges of research information among scholars, consultants, and corporate practitioners are limited. Many research studies are not well-grounded in theory, slowing the generation of new knowledge. As a result, it has been difficult to develop shared standards for research quality and to avoid redundancy in the research literature. Some excellent studies have failed to have impact because of lack of awareness.

The Kanter award raises awareness of high quality work-family research among the scholar, consultant, and practitioner communities. It fosters debate about what the standards of quality for work-family research should be, and ultimately will raise those standards. And it identifies the “best of the best” on which to base future research.

The award is named for Rosabeth Moss Kanter, who has been identified by leading scholars as the person having the most influence on the modern research literature on work and family. The proposals contained in her 1977 monograph *“Work and Family in the United States: A Critical Review and Agenda for Research and Policy”* remain timely a quarter-century later.

In this report you will find summaries of the 20 best scientific research articles published during the year 2003 and nominated for the 2004 Kanter award. These articles were selected after reviewing more than 2000 studies published in peer-reviewed journals. You also will find a list of all the articles nominated, email addresses for the authors, and a commentary giving an overview of the nominees. We appreciate very much the work of the authors and the reviewers who produced and selected these wonderful studies, and hope you will, too. Enjoy!

## Rosabeth Moss Kanter Biography

---

Rosabeth Moss Kanter is an internationally known business leader, award-winning author, and expert on strategy, innovation, and the management of change. She holds a chaired professorship at the Harvard Business School, advises major corporations and governments worldwide, and is the author or co-author of over 200 articles and professional published papers, and 13 books, including such best-sellers as *The Change Masters*, *Men and Women of the Corporation*, *When Giants Learn to Dance*, *The Challenge of Organizational Change*, and *World Class: Thriving Locally in the Global Economy*. Her latest books are *Rosabeth Moss Kanter on the Frontiers of Management* and the co-edited collection *Innovation*.

At Harvard Business School, in addition to her teaching and administrative responsibilities, she conceived and leads the Business Leadership in the Social Sector (BLSS) project, involving to date over a hundred national leaders (including U.S. Senators, Governors, corporate CEOs, national association heads, and the First Lady) in dialogue about public-private partnerships, and resulting in the launch of a BLSS video series initiated with nine new products and the pilot for a national television series. She also served as Editor of *Harvard Business Review* from 1989-1992, which was a finalist for a National Magazine Award for General Excellence in 1991.

Named one of the 100 most important women in America by the *Ladies Home Journal* and one of the 50 most powerful women in the world by the *Times of London*, she has received 19 honorary doctoral degrees and over a dozen leadership awards. She has served on many corporate boards, is a Fellow of the World Economic Forum, and serves on the Massachusetts Governor's Economic Council (for which she was co-chair of the International Trade Task Force).

Her public service activities span local and global interests. She is a judge for the Ron Brown Award for corporate leadership in the community (established by President Clinton to honor the late Secretary of Commerce), has served on the Board of Overseers for the Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award, co-chaired the Youth Service Advisory Board for General Colin Powell's America's Promise organization, and led the effort to establish a Year 2000 Commission for legacy projects for Boston (on which board she serves, along with numerous other national and civic boards such as City Year, the national urban youth service corps).

*(excerpted from [www.goodmeasure.com](http://www.goodmeasure.com))*

Excerpts from

## Work and Family in the United States: A Critical Review and Agenda for Research and Policy

---

by Rosabeth Moss Kanter  
Russell Sage Foundation, 1977

*Whatever one's definition of "normal" family life and optimal individual development, it is at least clear that poor economic position places undue stress on personal relations. There would seem to be little need to further document this association. However, it would be valuable in an area, such as this, to specify the conditions under which people cope most effectively with stresses introduced into their lives by work conditions, so that people can be supported in their own attempts to create satisfying lives. An emphasis on coping mechanisms, rather than only documenting statistical associations, would help alleviate the assumption of "pathology" introduced into discussions of the family life of the disadvantaged in the 1960s. We would learn about the sources of personal strength which social policy can help reinforce. Research, in short, should not contribute to foreclosing the options for people's private arrangements by assuming only a limited number of "healthy" or permissible life-styles.*

(P. 91)

*I have argued throughout this report that work and family are connected in many subtle and unsubtle, social, economic, and psychological ways belying the simplified version of the myth of separate worlds with which I began. If anything, the literature surveyed here makes evident the fact that separateness itself might be seen as a variable and a dimension, rather than a fixed aspect of social structure. We need to pay attention to the variety of patterns of separateness and connectedness between working and loving, occupations and families, in the United States. And we need to examine the consequences of these patterns of work-family association for the lives of American men, women, and children.*

(P. 89)



## Commentary

---

This report describes the top 20 research studies nominated for the 2004 Rosabeth Moss Kanter Award for Excellence in Work-Family Research, given for the best research article published during a given year. A large panel of scientists did the “heavy lifting,” wading through over 2000 published articles to find the best of the best. (The full process is described at the end of the report.) This report is a crib-sheet – an hour’s worth of reading will tell you about an entire year’s worth of the best scientific research about work/life from all over the world. Following this commentary, you will find summaries of each of the top 20 articles, contact information for their authors in case you have questions, and a description of the award process and its sponsors.

The review committee has become more diverse with each competition. The 2004 committee included scientists from the U.S., India, Hong Kong, Australia, Canada, the U.K., Austria, and the Netherlands. The list of scientific journals reviewed for the competition has continued to expand, now including journals from the fields of management, family studies, psychology, economics, demography, social work, and gerontology.

### Time at Work and at Home

How people allocate their time was a popular research topic in the 2004 competition. Several researchers worked to understand why people invest their time the way they do. **Finalist Rothbard\*** found that workers considered both how important and how enjoyable a particular role was when deciding how much time to devote to it. Not surprisingly, roles judged to be more important or more pleasurable got more time. What was a surprise was that work got more time when work was judged important AND when family was judged important. Furthermore, roles that were not pleasurable still got considerable time. In general, workers were more likely to sacrifice family time to work than the reverse.

Men and women face very different situations when it comes to allocating time, and several Kanter researchers dug into this issue in 2004. Kanter **winner Mattingly** explored the nature of men’s and women’s free time, finding that married and unmarried men had almost identical amounts of free time. For women, however, marriage not only reduced the amount of free time, but also reduced its frequency and increased the chances that it would be “contaminated” by other household responsibilities. Furthermore, women seemed to benefit less than men from their free time.

When free time gets contaminated, it is usually because of household work, which was the focus of finalist Bittman’s research. Past research in the U.S. has shown that men and women negotiate better deals for themselves in the division of household work when they control a larger share of the family’s resources. Using Australian data, Bittman examined how wives’ household work changed as their incomes increased relative to their husbands’. As with free time, husbands appeared to have negotiated a good deal: husbands who totally depended on their wives’ income did only 2.5 hours more housework per week than husbands who were primary providers. Australian women who earned more than their husbands increased their household work, perhaps to compensate for violating societal expectations that men should be primary providers.

---

*Reducing the contamination of free time will be helpful, particularly for women. Workplace-based services likely to reduce errand and chore time include concierge services, on-site dry cleaning, post office, banking, film developing, and dinners to go. Community resources that make it easier for parents to supervise children’s homework, such as homework help lines and web-based assignment schedules, also might be helpful.*

---

---

*As health care costs escalate, job stress and low quality of life will have more impact on the bottom line. Better balance will become even more of a business issue.*

---

Preferences for work hours also vary as a function of the larger economy. Stier found considerable diversity when looking at work-hour preferences across 27 countries in North America, Europe, Scandinavia, Asia, and the Middle East. Not surprisingly, workers with less economic security, whether because of inflation, inequality, or lower gross national product wanted to work more hours – this characterized post-communist countries, for example. Despite high averages for standard of living in their countries, workers in Canada and the U.S. tended to want to work more hours, perhaps because wealth is less evenly distributed in these countries.

### **Maximizing Well-Being**

In the U.S., a general assumption when discussing job stress seems to be that working less will reduce stress. This is unlikely to be true, of course, among families with low incomes. But what about quality of life among better-paid workers? For the accountants *Greenhaus* studied, more involvement at work was indeed associated with more stress and work-family conflict. Accountants who were highly involved and satisfied with both work and family were the most likely to report good quality of life.

Many researchers have pointed out that we spend far more time considering ways that work and family interfere with one another than ways that they can and do help each other. *Grzywacz* has been working to grow interest in the ways in which work and nonwork life facilitate or enhance one another. His findings showed that while conflict from work to family and from family to work both threatened psychological well-being, facilitation from family to work actually appeared to protect it.

---

*Employers may realize benefits by reducing work influences that interfere with marital quality. This might include involving spouses in decisions about and preparation for relocations, reassignments, or promotions. Also, flexibility or paid time-off banks are ways to help employees fulfill both their professional and their personal commitments.*

---

### **Wives and Mothers**

*Rogers*, a frequent Kanter nominee, has contributed several studies that test the impact of wives' employment on marriage and vice versa. This year, she examined the relationships between marital satisfaction and job satisfaction over time – do they affect each other, and if so, how? She found that satisfaction with marriage was more likely to lead to satisfaction with job than the reverse. This is a family-to-work effect, something that is much rarer in scientific findings than effects of work on family.

Over the years, Kanter nominees have devoted considerable attention to mothers and wages. Two studies tackle that issue this year. *Avellar* tested the idea that the wage penalty for motherhood is declining as society becomes more accepting of mothers' employment. Although there has been a small decline, it is not statistically significant. *Anderson* looked to see how wage penalties for mothers differ as a function of their education, their race, and their children's ages. Penalties were higher when children were younger and did not differ by race. Education made a big difference, however. High school graduates who returned to work after their children were older were consistently penalized 4-6% per year until their children were in high school, even after work hours and job types were taken into account. The researchers wondered whether lack of flexibility in the jobs of these less-educated women might be an important part of the picture.

### **Government Policies**

The U.S. undertook a major overhaul of its welfare system in 1996. Long-term studies of the impact of this reform are now becoming available. Welfare reform

carried with it changes in the expectations of both mothers and fathers. *Haney* was interested in what mothers, community workers, and policy makers thought about the responsibilities of fathers following welfare reform. While mothers and community workers focused heavily on fathers' interactions with their children and families, policy makers tended to focus much more on whether fathers married the mothers of their children, and on financial issues like child support. The researchers observed that an unintended consequence of this focus by policymakers is that it seems to let fathers "off the hook" for physical involvement in favor of financial support.

*Newman* observed that welfare reform was accompanied by rising expectations for children in schools newly responsible for demonstrating consistent improvement in scores on standardized tests. Some low-income parents feel put in a bind by competing needs to devote more time to paid work to provide for their families and more time to supporting their children's education. She studied a small number of families to observe how they resolved this dilemma, finding that most families made a choice of one over the other but felt troubled about the decision. Some families tried to do both well and usually were not able to. **Finalist** *Domínguez* studied similar families to observe whom they relied upon for help, and how they were able to get ahead. Past research has revealed extensive networks of support from friends and family among low income, particularly African-American, women. In this study, the researchers found that community-based agencies played a very important role for African-American women. For Latina women, it was harder to find agencies that were familiar with their needs and prepared to help. Leverage or upward mobility from social support came when women's networks of support were more diverse and when they provided contact with individuals who could offer advice, connections, or other resources that helped women improve their employment situations.

Several countries in Europe have dealt with parents' issues by substantially increasing paid leave following the birth of a child. *Ondrich* studied mothers' use of parental leave in Germany during several years when the availability of leave increased. Women working in larger firms, women with other family income, with more human capital, or working full-time were most likely to take advantage of these policies.

In addition to children's issues, most industrialized countries are preparing for an approaching tidal wave of retirements. *Williamson* studied U.S. workers aged 51-61 to see how many workers experienced unexpected changes in marital status (e.g., widowhood or divorce) or disability status (e.g., injury), and how they changed their participation in the labor force as a result. The results revealed that fully one-third of all workers had experienced a change in status. The consequences of these changes revealed "patterned vulnerability," where individuals with fewer resources, such as women, minorities, and less-educated individuals were affected much more. The financial well-being of these individuals was especially vulnerable to policy changes related to Social Security, particularly when they had already faced an unexpected change in status, suggesting that policy changes need to be phased in very gradually.

African-American women face more financial insecurity in old age than other women. *Willson* studied women's financial security and found that they often rely on their husbands' income as much or more than their own. This is particularly true of older women, who have had less labor force involvement or lower incomes.

---

*The need continues for initiatives that support women's ability to move ahead regardless of whether they have children. Organizations are realizing that with day care costs and transportation issues, it can become very difficult for low-income women to continue working. Any efforts to mediate this trend – day care stipends, flexibility including work at home, or compressed work weeks -- could be helpful.*

---

---

*It is critical that retirement preparation seminars or materials emphasize the high probability of unexpected changes in marital or disability status. Particular attention should be directed towards targeting high risk women through natural work groups (e.g., affinity groups, work areas that employ significant numbers of minority women). Increased attention on women's leadership and development for minority women could improve promotion rates, which would improve access to jobs that offer more financial security.*

---

Regardless of marriage, employment, or education, Black women have lower household incomes than White women, who are not only more likely to marry but also more likely to marry men with higher incomes.

Another feature of later life for many women is caregiving responsibility. In a study of Canadian nurses and family care providers, *Ward-Griffin* observed complex connections between the “formal care” provided by nurses and the “informal care” provided by family members. Rather than operating as two very separate and independent care systems, there was a “give and take” between caregivers, where tasks done by one were sometimes taken on by the other. Tasks performed by formal caregivers were especially likely to flow toward informal care givers, indicating that caregiving responsibilities will persist longer for informal than for formal providers.

### **Employer Policies**

Within their rapidly changing external environments, how do employers manage the work-family equation? *Pratt* examined three organizations with highly decentralized network marketing structures and demanding jobs to see how they fostered commitment. Analyses of internal communication documents and interviews with employees revealed that these employers successfully created emotional connections among workers by explicitly acknowledging their work-and-family issues, depicting work as a “necessary evil” to help them feel better about being away from their families.

*Kelly*, a former Kanter winner, studied the evolution of employer-sponsored child care in the U.S., finding that changes in tax law that were intended to spur the development of employer-sponsored child care centers had little effect until benefits consulting organizations pointed out that the same law could be used to spur development of flexible spending accounts for dependent care. Organizations relying on professional, managerial, or technical workers were almost 9 times more likely than others to offer employer-sponsored child care centers.

The best news for employers in this year's competition comes last. *Arthur*, using a very creative method of assembling credible data from existing sources, studied the impact of an announcement of a work-family initiative published in the *Wall Street Journal* on the share price of the firm. The resulting increase in share price was as large as the loss in share price that typically accompanied the announcement of layoffs. *Arthur* observed, “The average dollar value of the change in share price associated with a work-family initiative is approximately 60 million dollars per firm.” What better news could there be for the business case for work-life?!

\* For readers' convenience, only the name of the first author is used to refer to each nominated study.

---

*It is important for employers to know that there is a positive relationship between their work-family efforts and shareholder returns.*

---

The following symbols indicate the relevance of a particular article for work-life practitioners.

- Fairly relevant
- Relevant
- Quite relevant





## **The Winning Article**

Author Biographies and Summary

## Author Biographies

---

**Beth Mattingly** is completing her dissertation on the family and employment consequences of intimate partner violence at the University of Maryland. Her broad research focus is how gender roles influence family life. Published research includes analyses of time with children, including how perceived differences between parenting ideals and practices influence well-being, gender differences in free time, and the relationship between how parents feel about the amount of time they spend with their children and the actual amount of time they spend with them. Other interests include studying same-sex families and examining changes over time in wives' earning patterns among dual earners.

**Suzanne M. Bianchi** received her Ph.D. in Sociology from the University of Michigan (1978) and is currently Professor of Sociology at the University of Maryland. She is a former Director of the Maryland Population Research Center. She is also an Affiliate Faculty member of the Joint Program in Survey Methodology, the Women's Studies Department, and the School of Public Affairs. Prior to joining the Maryland faculty in 1994, she served as Assistant Chief for Social and Demographic Statistics in the Population Division of the U.S. Bureau of the Census.

Dr. Bianchi's research focuses on family demography and gender equality in the workplace. With Seth Sanders, and in conjunction with Duke University and the University of California, Los Angeles, Dr. Bianchi is currently engaged in a research project funded by the National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (NICHD) to design new models for explaining family change and variation. She has also recently conducted two new time diary data collections, with colleagues John Robinson and Melissa Milkie, and is writing a book on time use patterns in American families.

Dr. Bianchi has won many awards and served in several professional organizations. She was named Distinguished Scholar-Teacher by the University of Maryland for the 2003-2004 academic year, awarded the Creighton University Alumni Merit Award from the College of Arts and Sciences at Creighton University (2003), and earned the Otis Dudley Duncan Award for outstanding scholarship in social demography from the Sociology of Population Section of the American Sociological Association. Dr. Bianchi served as President of the Population Association of America (PAA) in 2000 and she currently is Co-Editor (with Kenneth Hill) of *Demography*. She has served as Chair of the Family Section and of the Population Section of the American Sociological Association (ASA). She is also a member of the National Council on Family Relations (NCFR) and the International Union for the Scientific Study of Population (IUSSP). She currently serves on the Board of Overseers of the General Social Survey and the Panel Study of Income Dynamics, and is on the Board of Trustees of the Population Reference Bureau.



---

## Gender Differences in the Quantity and Quality of Free Time: The U.S. Experience

---

M. J. Mattingly & S. M. Bianchi

***Social Forces***

**Volume 81, 2003, pp. 999-1030**

mmattingly@socy.umd.edu

Previous research suggests that women and men experience their free time differently. (Free time is time not committed to the labor force, domestic caregiving, or personal care.) This study looks at gender differences in the quantity and quality of free time, whether work and family roles restrict free time significantly more for women than men, and the relationship between the amount of free time individuals report and their subjective feelings of time pressure.

This study used secondary analysis of 1,132 telephone interviews collected by the Survey Research Center at the University of Maryland. This study also used newly collected time diary data to measure gender differences in both the quantity and quality of free time.

This study found that men and women do experience free time differently. On average, men have nearly half an hour more free time per day than women. Time diaries showed mixed evidence regarding gender differences in the quality of free time. Quality was measured in terms of the contamination of free time with outside nonleisure activities.

Interestingly, married and unmarried men had similar amounts of free time, but married women had almost an hour less free time than their unmarried counterparts.

Parenthood affected the free time of both women and men, but particularly women. Mothers of preschoolers experienced less free time overall and fewer episodes of free time than other women, but the presence of a preschooler had no measurable impact on the free time of fathers. Unexpectedly, working in the labor force increased amounts of free time for men but there was little difference in the free time of employed and nonemployed women. Free time appears to benefit women less than men because they feel more time pressure.

This study suggests that despite great efforts to reduce gender inequity, women still have less free time than men. Women still bear most of the responsibility for childrearing and caregiving, which reduces both the quantity and the quality of their free time.

*Summary prepared by Kate Vaught & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“A triple burden is apparent. Women have less free time. The free time they have is often contaminated by other activities or the presence of children, and their free time is not as beneficial to them as men’s in terms of reducing feelings of time pressure.”*

---

(P. 1022)

## Summaries of Finalist Articles



---

## When Does Gender Trump Money? Bargaining and Time in Household Work

---

M. Bittman, P. England, N. Folbre, L. Sayer & G. Matheson

*American Journal of Sociology*  
Volume 109, 2003, pp. 186-214  
P-England@northwestern.edu

This article aimed to explain situations where “money talks” in determining the division of housework, particularly when wives earn the same or more than their husbands. These issues have been studied several times in the U.S., but not in Australia, where the current study was conducted.

The authors used data from the 1992 Australian National Time Diary Survey. Two-day diaries completed by 2,244 couples were used for data analysis.

Findings showed that as wives earned more of the couple’s income, they were able to bargain for fewer hours of housework, performing the smallest number of hours of housework when they earned about the same as husbands: slightly over 20, compared to husbands’ 10. This was almost six hours per week less than women who depended entirely on their husbands’ earnings. Unexpectedly, wives who earned more than their husbands also took on up to six hours *more* housework per week than wives who earned the same. Men’s hours of housework were not related to the proportion of household income they contributed. In families with one child where men and women worked the same hours and earned the same amount, women performed three more hours of housework per week than men.

The authors compared the Australian sample with a U.S. sample (the 1987 National Survey of Families and Households). Although U.S. husbands were more likely than Australians to increase their housework when they earned less than their wives, the difference was small -- husbands who were totally dependent on their wives’ income did only 2.5 more hours of housework per week than husbands who were primary providers. The principle that relative spousal income allows women to bargain for doing less housework was true for American wives and for Australians who earned less than their husbands, but Australian wives who earned more than their husbands increased their hours of housework. The authors concluded that husbands’ housework was less likely than wives’ to respond to patterns of relative earnings in both countries. Work-family policies that reduce the emphasis on men’s provider roles and the sex gap in wages are needed.

Summary prepared by Chiung-Ya Tang & Shelley M. MacDermid

---

*“As things move to greater male economic dependency [in Australia] where men are not enacting masculinity through providing money, women pick up more of the housework - as if to neutralize the man’s deviance.”*

(P. 203)

---



---

## Creating Networks for Survival and Mobility: Social Capital Among African-American and Latin-American Low-Income Mothers

---

S. Domínguez & C. Watkins

### ***Social Problems***

**Volume 50, 2003, pp. 111-135**

c-watkins@northwestern.edu

---

*“...the kind of social capital that generates opportunities for mobility can emerge from networks that provide advice and encouragement to get ahead.”*

(P. 130)

---

The significance of social networks has been studied often in family research. Social networks provide support that helps people to cope with stresses of everyday life. Social networks also can provide “social leverage,” upward mobility or increased opportunities for advancement, by increasing contact individuals who may have access to education, training, and employment. This study examined how social networks can provide support or leverage among African-American and Latin-American low-income mothers.

This two-year study used extensive interviews with five African-American and five Latin-American mothers, nine of whom were single, who lived in low-income Boston neighborhoods. Interviews usually took place in the women’s homes, and the researchers also went on outings with the women to social service agencies or to family celebrations. The small sample size allowed for an in-depth analysis and observation of changes in behavior over time.

Women relied on family, extended kinships, friendships, and social service organizations for social support. When the women lived away from their families, they received less social support, less frequently. Family tension caused by drug and/or alcohol use lowered the amount of social support the women received. Women who received social support from friendships worried about trust and the give and take of resources -- with the social expectation of “giving back,” social support carried benefits such as opportunities to help others but also costs like extra stress. Community organizations made an enormous difference in the lives of some of these women, particularly African Americans, assisting them with child care, health care, food, and job training. Some Latina women faced barriers in access to such organizations because they were new immigrants.

The women worked hard to develop themselves in order to achieve upward mobility. Networks provided social leverage by giving advice, encouragement for getting ahead, and contacts. A large, diverse social network, and particular types and places of employment helped women to advance by providing opportunities to make contacts. Social support and social leverage networks worked together and also against each other in influencing survival and upward mobility.

*Summary prepared by Kate Vaught & Shelley M. MacDermid*



---

## Spillover Between Marital Quality and Job Satisfaction: Long-Term Patterns and Gender Difference

---

S. J. Rogers & D. C. May

*Journal of Marriage and Family*

Volume 65, 2003, pp. 482-495

sjr11@psu.edu

The aim of this study was to answer the question, “how do job satisfaction and marital quality affect one another over time?” In the past, researchers and others have wondered whether women’s careers interfere with the quality of their marriages. Unfortunately, few longitudinal data sets exist that allow researchers to determine whether job satisfaction leads to marital quality or the reverse. This study also assessed similarities and differences between men and women in terms of job satisfaction and marital quality, which was measured using marital satisfaction and marital problems.

Data came from the 12-year longitudinal “Marital Instability over the Life Course” study, which included a nationally representative sample of 1065 married individuals younger than 55 years of age from four waves of data collection (1980, 1983, 1988, 1992). Participants were employed during at least two consecutive waves of collection and were continuously married.

Findings showed that increases in marital satisfaction contributed to increases in job satisfaction more than the reverse. In contrast, increases in marital discord decreased job satisfaction over time. Unexpectedly, the influences of marital quality on job satisfaction were similar for married men and women.

For both women and men, the work-family relationship extended beyond daily interactions to affect long-term satisfaction. The evidence did not support an argument that women’s employment threatens marital satisfaction. Instead, more satisfying marriages seem to produce greater job satisfaction. Thus, employers may realize benefits by reducing work influences that interfere with marital quality.

*Summary prepared by Mary K. Schultheis & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“Increases in marital satisfaction contributed significantly to increases in job satisfaction.”*

(P. 490)

---



---

## Investment in Work and Family Roles: A Test of Identity and Utilitarian Motives

---

N. P. Rothbard & J. R. Edwards

*Personnel Psychology*

Volume 56, 2003, pp. 699-730

nrothbard@wharton.upenn.edu

---

*“... an employee who identifies highly with family but not with work invests virtually the same amount of time in work as an employee who identifies highly with work but not with family. Moreover, an employee who identifies highly with both work and family invests twice as much time in work as a person who is only highly identified with either work or family.”*

(P. 723)

Despite much public discussion about long work hours, we do not yet have good explanations for why people choose to work the number of hours they do. To explore what motivates people to invest time in work and family roles, the authors of this study tested the “identity” and “utilitarian” explanations. The identity perspective argues that people make investments in roles based on their personal importance. According to the utilitarian perspective, people invest in roles that provide pleasure and avoid roles that provide displeasure.

Data came from a survey of 1,310 employees at a large public university in the Midwest; 623 surveys were used in the final analyses. Using a statistical technique called structural equation modeling, the authors first analyzed how the identity (importance) and utilitarian (pleasure) motives were related to time spent working or with family. They also examined how time spent at work and with family were related to one another, and gender differences in these relationships.

As predicted by the identity perspective, men and women generally spent more time in roles that were important to them. In fact, greater importance of not just work but also family roles was related to more time spent working. In addition, as predicted by the utilitarian perspective, people spent more time working or with their families when they found that involvement more pleasurable, and if they found involvement in one role pleasurable they devoted less time to the other. Unexpectedly, people also spent more time in roles that generated displeasure, perhaps because they were investing time to solve problems. In terms of relationships between the roles, increases in work time were associated with decreases in family time; the effect of family time on work time was smaller and evident only for women. This suggests that people are more likely to sacrifice family time to meet work demands than the reverse.

*Summary prepared by Young In Kwon & Shelley M. MacDermid*

## **Summaries of the Remaining Articles in the Kanter Top 20**



---

## The Motherhood Wage Penalty Revisited: Experience, Heterogeneity, Work Effort, and Work-Schedule Flexibility

---

D. J. Anderson, M. Binder & K. Krause

***Industrial and Labor Relations Review***

**Volume 56, 2003, pp. 273-294**

djanders@email.arizona.edu

Many explanations are given for the pay difference between mothers and women without children. This study extends previous work by focusing on the heterogeneity in the timing of mothers' return to the work force, mothers' efforts at work, and work-schedule conflicts.

Surveys from the 1988 National Longitudinal Survey of Labor Market Experience of Young Women (NLSYW) were used in the analysis. The sample, although large, was restricted to non-Hispanic Whites and Blacks. Several notable differences among mothers and non-mothers were seen in the sample. Mothers compared to non-mothers tended to be Black, married, and worked part time. Mothers were four years older and had one year less of education than non-mothers. Women who were mothers at some point earned 6% less than women who had never been mothers.

Results of the study indicate that mothers tend to have a higher difference in pay when they first return to work, regardless of the age of their children. This might be attributed to their experience level with managing the combination of work and mothering. Children have more illnesses when they first enter daycare or school, and mothers may take the first job offered when re-entering the work force. An analysis of penalties using age of the children and mothers' race reveals that mothers with younger children made less money than mothers with older children; while there were no differences based on race. Large differences were seen based on education. College-educated women faced no penalties for having children, while high school dropouts experienced a 3% penalty if their children were infants and toddlers, but had no penalties if they waited to return to work until their children were older. Interestingly, high school graduates who returned to work after their children were older were consistently penalized by 4-6% until their children entered high school.

Although high school graduates are penalized more than other mothers, the researchers conclude that it is unlikely that they put forth any less work effort. Instead, they suggest that less work-schedule flexibility may be a better explanation for the observed education differences in the motherhood wage penalty.

*Summary prepared by Belinda Richardson, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“Although more educated women are likely to have jobs in which effort is relatively important, we find that college-educated mothers do not, in fact, face any penalty for having children.”*

---

(P. 291)



---

## Share Price Reactions to Work-Family Initiatives: An Institutional Perspective

---

M. M. Arthur

*Academy of Management Journal*

Volume 46, 2003, pp. 497-505

arthur@mgt.unm.edu

The business case for work-life initiatives requires that they be good for business, not just for workers, but it can be very difficult to isolate bottom-line impact. This researcher used a creative approach to assessing the impact of new work-life initiatives on share price. Based on “institutional” theory, she hypothesized that announcements of new initiatives would increase share price, particularly in high-tech industries that rely on highly skilled workers, industries that employ high proportions of women, industries with low unemployment rates, and after work-family initiatives had been implemented in at least half of the large firms in the U.S. (i.e., been “legitimized”).

Data were gathered about all *Fortune* 500 firms from 1971-1996. Data about accounting and stock market performance, firm age and size, and human resource policies all were gathered from archival records (e.g., from the Center for Research in Security Prices at the University of Chicago). During the study period, 231 work-family initiatives were announced in the *Wall Street Journal*; the single largest group of these dealt with dependent care. In order to isolate effects, announcements were dropped from consideration unless they were the only announcement from that company about work-family initiatives in a three-day period.

The findings revealed a positive relationship between work-family initiative announcements and shareholder returns, particularly after 1981 when most large firms had become aware of such initiatives. The average three-day return between 1981 and 1996 was 0.48%. This compares to average decreases in share price of 0.38% associated with layoff announcements and 0.33% associated with discrimination lawsuits. As hypothesized, returns were higher in high-tech firms and in industries with large proportions of women; there was no evidence that shareholder returns due to work-family announcements were significantly greater (or less) during times of low unemployment. The author also notes that firms named the “best company for working mothers” reaped an increase in share price of 0.69 percent, citing a 1996 study by Hannon and Milkovich.

*Summary prepared by Kate Vaught & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“The average dollar value of the change in share price associated with a work-family initiative is approximately 60 million dollars per firm.”*

(P. 504)

---



---

## Has the Price of Motherhood Declined Over Time? A Cross-Cohort Comparison of the Motherhood Wage Penalty

---

S. Avellar & P. J. Smock

*Journal of Marriage and Family*

Volume 65, 2003, pp. 597-607

savellar@umich.edu

Recent work characterizing women's labor force participation has identified a phenomenon termed the "motherhood penalty," which suggests that average wages of mothers are less than average wages of women without children even after considering human capital, labor market experience, and part-time work status. This study investigated the temporal changes in the motherhood penalty to determine whether the motherhood penalty declined over time.

Data came from the 1975-1985 waves of the National Longitudinal Survey of Young Women and the 1986-1998 waves of National Longitudinal Survey of Youth. The sample was limited to women who were 21 years of age or older with at least 2 years of reported wages resulting in large representative samples of women in each cohort.

Results for both cohorts of women indicated that the motherhood penalty has not declined over time. Work experience among mothers has increased significantly across two cohorts; however, the mean hourly wage (in 1993 dollars) has remained stable: \$11.03 in the earlier and \$11.19 in the more recent cohort. On the other hand, the gap between mothers and childless women does show signs of decreasing for hourly wage and educational attainment. Although one model showed that each child significantly lessened the wages of women in the early cohort and in the more recent cohort by about 1.6% and 1% respectively, and another model indicated that children were linked with about a 3.8% penalty in hourly wage in the early cohort and a 3.3% penalty in the later cohort, when tested explicitly, the difference between the two cohorts in both models was not significant, indicating that the motherhood penalty had not declined significantly over time. Among other family and labor market characteristics that did show a change over time, the findings indicated that 16 or more years of education had become significantly more valuable over time and that being married appeared to increase women's wages over time.

Thus, although common expectations might suggest that the motherhood penalty would decline over time because human capital differences and employer discrimination have diminished, the motherhood penalty has been quite stable and will likely continue to contribute to gender inequality in the workplace.

*Summary prepared by Gunnur Karakurt, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*"...if women continue to be the parents largely responsible for child care, mothers will be unable to catch up to childless women or to men without such responsibilities..."*

---

(P. 605)



---

## The Relation Between Work-Family Balance and Quality of Life

---

J. H. Greenhaus, K. M. Collins & J. D. Shaw

*Journal of Vocational Behavior*

Volume 63, 2003, pp. 510-531

greenhaus@drexel.edu

A wealth of research on work-family balance is available but lacks scrutiny on how individual well-being is impacted. This study proposes a comprehensive definition that alleviates confusion with other concepts in work-family literature, while developing a measurement to fit the definition. Since well-being is considered an indicator of quality of life, the relationship between work-family balance and quality of life is examined.

The sample consists of participants who are employed in public accounting and are members of the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants (AICPA). A large number of randomly selected members receive surveys and 42.8% respond. The final analysis includes participants who are married or in a long-term relationship and have one child as a minimum. Participants included a majority of men and the average age of both men and women is 35.2. The majority were accounting majors, with supervisors and staff or senior accountants represented.

The study defines work-family balance as “the extent to which an individual is equally engaged in—and equally satisfied with—his or her work role and family role” (p. 513). The findings show that work-family balance is associated with quality of life but only under certain conditions. Balance is not related to quality of life under conditions of limited time, limited involvement, or limited satisfaction since there is little to allocate between roles. Conversely, quality of life is associated with work-family balance when substantial time, substantial involvement, and substantial satisfaction are distributed across work and family roles. Those who were more engaged in or more satisfied with family than work experienced the highest quality of life whereas those who were more engaged in or more satisfied with work than family experienced the lowest quality of life. Contrary to expectations, family imbalanced groups (those who invested more time and involvement in family than work) experienced the least work-to-family conflict, work imbalanced groups (those who invested more time and involvement in work than family) experienced the most work-to-family conflict, and balanced groups fell in between these extremes. Confirming previous research, this study highlights the negative effect of work imbalance on quality of life which is due to higher levels of work-family conflict and stress.

---

*“When individuals invest relatively little time or involvement in their combined work and family roles, or when they derive little satisfaction from their combined roles, work-family balance is unrelated to quality of life.”*

(P. 525)

---

Summary prepared by Belinda Richardson, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid



---

## Work, Family, Mental Health: Testing Different Models of Work-Family Fit

---

J. G. Grzywacz & B. L. Bass

***Journal of Marriage and Family***

**Volume 65, 2003, pp. 248-262**

grzywacz@wfubmc.edu

---

*“As the work force and labor market continue addressing the challenge of work-family interface, increased attention needs to be given to work-family facilitation, how it can be cultivated and exploited, and how it operates in conjunction with work-family conflict in shaping desirable individual, family and work outcomes.”*

(P. 259)

---

Work-family conflict is well-known as a challenge for workers. Less well-known is work-family facilitation. This study examined the effects of conflict and facilitation on mental health. Work-family conflict is defined as incompatibilities between work and family responsibilities due to limited resources. Work-family facilitation is defined as ways that work and family enhance or help each other, such as when skills learned at work are useful at home. The researchers hypothesized that mental health would be better when conflict was lower and facilitation was higher.

Using the 1997 National Survey of Midlife Development in the United States, the authors studied a large representative sample of men and women. They measured depression, anxiety, alcohol dependence, and conflict and facilitation from work to family and family to work. The primary statistical analyses were conducted using multivariate logistic regression.

Results of the study indicated that poor mental health was associated with higher levels of conflict from both work to family and family to work. Facilitation from family to work was associated with better psychological well-being. In other words, family-to-work facilitation had a protective influence on psychological well-being.

*Summary prepared by Gunnur Karakurt & Shelley M. MacDermid*



---

## Married Fathers and Caring Daddies: Welfare Reform and the Discursive Politics of Paternity

---

L. Haney & M. March

### ***Social Problems***

**Volume 50, 2003, pp. 461-481**

lynne.haney@nyu.edu

Welfare reform redefined the responsibilities of women and how society views motherhood. Fathers also were considered central to welfare reform. The political debate surrounding the new fatherhood legislation created new programs targeted to fathers. However, it was unknown whether fatherhood defined by policymakers was consistent with fatherhood beliefs and practices held by the members of the communities most affected by reform. This study explored this issue through an analysis of fatherhood discourses by policymakers and by low-income women.

Data were drawn from two sources: transcripts of the legislation and testimony by members of Congress over a four-year period collected from the online LexisNexis database, and through narratives of fatherhood produced in 51 in-depth interviews of low-income African-American women. The women were drawn from a long-running study of disadvantaged families, the Baltimore Parent-hood Study. This sample provides a diverse group with experience with the welfare system and represents those targeted by welfare reform. Political debates on fatherhood were deconstructed and compared to the interviews of the women in the study.

Stark contrasts existed between the two groups. Policymakers emphasized form over function. They placed priority on men's biological connection and financial obligations (i.e., being good breadwinners) to the children. On the other hand, women placed more importance on men identifying with the role of a father and being involved and committed to the children. They separated men's marital connection and material contribution from the responsibilities of fatherhood.

Interviews indicated that there was an agreement on how fatherhood was defined by the community, but it was inconsistent with the model portrayed by policymakers. A community model focused on practical application grounded in personal and social experience rather than ideology and conservative notions of "family values." Policymakers would do well not to ignore these conceptions of fathering and to replace their narrow definitions of fatherhood with more realistic forms that are sensitive to conditions in low-income communities.

*Summary prepared by Belinda Richardson, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*"By making money a central issue, they would enable biological fathers to escape from other responsibilities . . . [avoiding] obligations these women found far more important to their children's well-being than money."*

(P. 474)

---



---

## The Strange History of Employer-Sponsored Child Care: Interested Actors, Uncertainty, and the Transformation of Law in Organizational Fields

---

E. Kelly

*American Journal of Sociology*  
Volume 109, 2003, pp. 606-649  
Kelly101@umn.edu

---

*“Tax breaks represent the broadest, and until recently, the most expensive child care policy in the United States.”*  
(P.607)

---

Although the number of mothers in the work force has increased dramatically in the past 40 years, the United States does not have a coherent child care policy. Kelly examines the development and diffusion of two types of employment benefits: dependent care expense accounts and employer-sponsored child care centers. A 1981 revision to the tax code was intended to encourage employers to create new child care centers. However, few companies established child care centers; instead they adopted dependent care expense accounts. How and why did this occur?

Kelly investigates whether ambiguity of the law or the fragmentation of policy-making and regulatory process is responsible for collective construction of the law. To do so, she surveyed 389 U.S. organizations about the likelihood of adopting child care programs and dependent care expense accounts, and also used historical research. The industries in this study represented manufacturing, service, public, and nonprofit organizations.

---

*“Dependent care expense accounts are now closely tied to cafeteria plans, and both programs have been promoted by benefits consultants and brokers.”*  
(P.624)

---

Companies responded to the change in the tax law, but only after the law was reinterpreted by benefits consulting companies to allow inexpensive options. Consulting firms used this new tax law in their efforts to market new “cafeteria plans” or flexible benefits programs. They argued that providing flexible dependent care expense accounts was one way to be more family-friendly while costing employers relatively little. This interpretation of the law was eventually approved by the Internal Revenue Service. Dependent care expense accounts were more likely to be adopted by companies that had contact with a benefits consultant or had their own benefits department. Larger organizations, organizations with a higher percentage of parents, and organizations with tight labor markets were more likely to adopt dependent care expense accounts. Unionized organizations were about half as likely as other organizations to provide accounts. In contrast, child care centers were adopted based on the internal characteristics of the work force such as size, sector, and traits. Organizations that depended on professionals, managers, or technical workers were almost nine times more likely to provide child care centers than other organizations.

*Summary prepared by Abigail Tolhurst Christiansen, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*



---

## High Stakes: Time Poverty, Testing, and the Children of the Working Poor

---

K. S. Newman & M. M. Chin

***Qualitative Sociology***

**Volume 26, 2003, pp. 3-34**

katherine.newman @harvard.edu

Major policy shifts have occurred in two areas in the United States—welfare and education. Although they are unrelated, they come together to affect working poor households. Education reform is a challenge for low-income families who themselves are unprepared to handle increased educational standards. This study focused on the choices made by low-income parents when faced with simultaneous needs to provide for their children economically and help them meet new standards in education.

Ethnographic data were collected over a one-year period from twelve families (four African-American, four Puerto Rican and four Dominican). Families were observed in everyday settings and structured interviews were conducted. These families were part of a six-year study in New York City that provides longitudinal qualitative research beginning before and continuing until after educational and welfare reforms were in place. The study examines how working poor parents dealt with the dual dilemma of employment and support of their children's education.

For most families, it was very difficult or impossible to both improve their economic situation through employment and support their children's education through parental involvement. Families developed two types of adaptations—monitoring and trade-offs. Monitoring took the form of volunteering in the school or spending time going over homework. Other families felt forced to choose a priority, either work or their child's education, resulting in a trade-off. In some cases, adaptation was not possible, resulting in what the researchers called a “drowning” situation because life in these families became so chaotic.

*Summary prepared by Belinda Richardson & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“These adaptations ... pit the economic security and the occupational mobility prospects of the parents against the educational needs of the children.”*

(P. 19)

---



---

## The Liberalization of Maternity Leave Policy and the Return to after Childbirth in Germany

---

J. Ondrich, C. K. Spiess, Q. Yang & G. G. Wagner

***Review of Economics of the Household***

**Volume 1, 2003, pp. 77-110**

jjondrich@maxwell.syr.edu

---

*“When a mother goes on maternity leave her employer must decide whether or not to assign her responsibilities to co-workers or hire a new employee...”*

---

(P.81)

Parental leave policies have both benefits and costs for organizations. Protecting mothers' jobs allows companies to retain their human capital investment, but may increase labor market inflexibility and lead to discrimination against women of child-bearing age. While these policies also allow parents to be with and care for their newborns, there is concern that if parental leaves are long enough, there may be serious consequences for a mother's human capital development (i.e., continued job training). The relationship between long parental leaves and human capital development for mothers is the focal point of this study.

The authors looked at 697 maternity leaves for working mothers who gave birth in West Germany between the years of 1984 and 1991. These data are from the English Language User File of the German Socio-Economic Panel (GSOEP). In 1986, German federal maternity leave and benefits were lengthened and currently stand at three years of leave and two years of benefits. For all years of the study, the six weeks prior to childbirth and the eight weeks after childbirth were considered the “mother protection” period. The authors examined the probability that mothers would return to work as a function of time, policy changes, education, marital status, age, nationality, income, work status, years in the labor force, firm size, benefit-wage ratio, and whether or not the leave was for a first child.

Mothers giving birth to their first child were less likely to return to work during the mother-protection period. Women who worked in large firms of over 20 employees were less likely to return to work during the mother-protection period than mothers who worked for smaller firms. Age had a U-shaped effect on the likelihood of returning to work, indicating perhaps that work is secondary during prime childbearing years but rises in importance later in life. Mothers with other family income were more likely to delay their return to work. Mothers with more human capital took greater advantage of the full extent of potential leave. Mothers who worked full-time returned to work somewhat slower than those who worked part-time. Overall, the authors found that employment conditions or job expectations frequently changed for mothers who take longer parental leaves.

*Summary prepared by Abigail Tolhurst Christiansen, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*



---

## Transforming Work-Family Conflict into Commitment in Network Marketing Organizations

---

M. G. Pratt & J. A. Rosa

*Academy of Management Journal*

Volume 48, 2003, pp. 395-418

mpratt@uiuc.edu

The study examined commitment in network marketing organizations. A key focus was understanding how these organizations transformed work-family conflicts into commitment.

The sample consisted of distributors from Amway Corporation, Mary Kay Inc., and The Longaberger Company. Archival materials, such as books and booklets/monographs, Internet sites, audio- and videotapes, and issues of monthly publications spanning several years were used to understand how the organizations socialized new members. Data also were gathered through observations and interviews.

The findings show that network marketing organizations recognize that work-non-work conflict exists. Moreover they specifically target recruitment and socialization efforts to workers with children at home, stressing the importance of family while depicting work as a “necessary evil.” These organizations transform ambivalence about having to spend time away from their families while working via the creation of *relationship-based commitments* that were fostered by (1) “making workers into family” that is, by building strong interorganizational bonds and (2) using non-work bonds by “bringing family into work” practices. This is done through making all the workers within the organizations work together and support each other so that the managers can relate to the workers and the workers can relate to the managers through family and work issues.

This research has implications for the management practices of companies who want to integrate commitment and work-family issues. How people feel about the positive and negative aspects of work can increase their commitment to work. The first suggestion is to develop a philosophy of how work and family are related. Another is managing nonwork factors, such as family and spirituality, that can influence the worker’s commitment. A third suggestion is to emphasize the importance of family by using practices to make their workers better parents or spouses.

*Summary prepared by Mary Schultheis, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“There is a preference to recruit married men and women, especially those with children, because ‘they will have more reasons to be motivated.’*

(P. 400)

---



---

## Time to Work: A Comparative Analysis of Preferences for Working Hours

---

H. Stier & N. Lewin-Epstein

***Work and Occupations***  
**Volume 30, 2003, pp. 302-326**  
haya1@post.tau.ac.il

Despite an overall decrease in the number of hours worked across many countries, there is still great diversity in work hours. This study examines both men's and women's preferences related to working hours in 22 countries, using both individual and country-level factors in order to explain workers' preferences.

Data used for this study come from the 1997 International Social Survey Program on Work Orientation, which contains questions relating to preferences in working time. Participating countries were in North America, eastern and western Europe including Scandinavia, the Pacific, and the Middle East.

Workers in Mediterranean (e.g., Portugal) and post-communist (e.g., Russia, Bulgaria) countries reported wanting to increase their working hours. In contrast, workers in other countries (e.g., Switzerland, Scandinavia, Japan) preferred to work fewer hours. Unexpectedly, given high averages in standard of living, substantial proportions of workers in Canada and the U.S. expressed desire to increase work hours.

Overall, women were far more likely than men to want to increase their work hours, probably because women are more likely than men to be working part-time or to be nonemployed. Relative to men, women in Russia, Bulgaria, Poland, and Portugal, were especially likely to prefer to work more hours. Women in Italy, the United Kingdom, France, and especially Japan were more likely than men to want to decrease their work hours. Current employment status affects preferences about working hours. Both men and women not currently employed wanted to work more hours. Both men and women currently working full-time were more likely than those working less to want to reduce work hours. In general, employees working part-time did not wish to increase their hours.

Preferences for more work hours were higher when inflation was higher, when there was more inequality in a country, and when GNP or female labor force participation was lower. Thus, economic insecurity for both individuals and countries was associated with more interest in increasing work hours.

*Summary prepared by Kate Vaught & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*“One general conclusion is that women more than men are dissatisfied with their current time-allocation situation.”*

(P. 315)

---



---

## Reconceptualizing the Relationship between “Public” and “Private” Eldercare

---

C. Ward-Griffin & V. W. Marshall

*Journal of Aging Studies*  
Volume 17, 2003, pp. 189-208  
cwg@uwo.ca

Conceptualizations of “private” and “public” care for disabled elders have changed over time. This Canadian study proposes a new conceptualization of the relationship between formal and informal care using the socialist-feminist approach. The utility of this model is illustrated by examining the nurse-family caregiver relationship in home care.

Considerable debate exists over whether caregiving provided by “formal” paid health professionals complements, parallels, competes with, or substitutes for “informal” unpaid care provided by family members or friends. The current compensatory, substitution, task specific and complementary models are limiting because they assume that formal and informal care are distinct entities. Moreover, they reflect the interests of the formal care system, they assume that family care is preferred to formal care, and they tend to ignore gender relations within the family. A socialist-feminist perspective is proposed which incorporates the conceptualizations of “intermediate domain” where private and public domains intersect, and “work transfer” where waged workers are eliminated and their tasks transferred to women in the family. Since gender powerfully shapes caregiving experience, the focus of this study is on the experiences of female family caregivers.

Participants included both community nurses and family members who were mutually providing care for elders over the age of 65 years. Data were gathered from in-depth interviews with 23 nurse-family caregiver dyads.

Examining care revealed complex boundaries between formal and informal caregiving. However, findings also revealed that nurses and family caregivers engaged in bidirectional work transfer: from nurses to family caregivers, and to a lesser extent, from family caregivers to nurses such that the distinction between “skilled” and “unskilled” care gradually faded over time. In general, findings supported a (reverse) substitution model with informal caregivers substituting and/or replacing care originally provided by formal caregivers. Overall, this study suggests that relations between family caregivers and health professionals are dynamic and change over time. The linkages between formal and informal care depend on the duration of the relationship. Substituting and supplementing caring work are two essential, interrelated components of the work transfer process.

Summary prepared by Gunnur Karakurt, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid

---

*“...a socialist-feminist perspective views female caregiving as highly skilled emotional, mental, and physical work that crosses “public” and “private” boundaries.”*

(P 204)

---



---

## Interrupted Trajectories and Labor Force Participation

---

J. B. Williamson & T. K. McNamara

### **Research on Aging**

**Volume 25, 2003, pp. 87-121**

john.williamson.1@bc.edu

What happens to workers when their marital or disability status changes unexpectedly? These researchers examined a large sample of workers to understand workers' decisions to reduce or increase their involvement in the labor force as a function of widowhood and disability. They hypothesized that workers' decisions would vary as a function of their access to Social Security, race, gender, and education.

The researchers used the first four waves (1992, 1994, 1996, 1998) of the Health and Retirement Study. Valid data included 5,942 respondents who were born between 1931 and 1941 and were at the age of 51 to 61 in 1992.

About one in three members of the sample reported having an unplanned change in disability status or marital status between 1992 and 1998. The unplanned changes affected retirement probabilities differently depending on race, gender, and education. For example, a change in marital status increased the likelihood of employment among Black men but decreased it among White women. Additionally, individuals with less-than-average levels of education changed labor force participation more in response to changes in disability status. However, the timing of a change in disability altered the effects of unplanned events on labor force participation. For example, older workers tended to delay returning to work because they were more likely to have access to pensions and Social Security income. Workers who wanted to make up lost assets or to maintain eligibility for financial and social resources tended to return to the labor force sooner.

The researchers observed "patterned vulnerability" in responses to unplanned events, where individuals with fewer resources such as women, minorities, and those with low education, were especially affected by eligibility rules for programs such as Social Security. Given this patterned vulnerability and the large proportion of the sample that experienced unexpected changes in status, changes in Social Security eligibility must be implemented very gradually, and policies aimed at reducing the negative effects of unexpected events are needed.

*Summary prepared by Chiung-Ya Tang & Shelley M. MacDermid*

---

*"Although the retirement age is becoming less tightly keyed to chronological age, the institutional life course may retain a stronger hold over racial minorities, those with low education, and women."*

(P. 115)

---



---

## Race and Women's Income Trajectories: Employment, Marriage, and Income Security Over the Life Course

---

A. E. Willson

### *Social Problems*

Volume 50, 2003, pp. 87-110

awillson@email.unc.edu

The risk of experiencing financial insecurity in old age is much higher for African-American women as compared to White women. Rather than through their own continuous employment, financial security is often built through their husbands' employment for older women. Therefore, this article examines the impact of race, marriage, and employment on the security of women's income over their life course. Particularly, this study focuses on over-time differences in the major determinants of income security among subgroups. In order to understand how these trajectories are shaped by long-term processes, the Mature Women Cohort of the National Longitudinal Surveys of Labor Market Experience is used.

The author studied a large representative sample: 5,083 women over the period from 1967 to 1997 with 5-year intervals – 1967, 1972, 1977, 1982, 1987, 1992, 1997. Growth curve models were used to study repeated measures on the group of individuals to understand the effects of marriage, employment, age, race, education, and health on income trajectories.

Results of the study indicated that when assessing income inequality over time, not only employment but also marriage must be taken into consideration. Moreover, race plays a significant role in structuring income security over the life cycle. Black women have substantially lower household incomes regardless of their marital history, employment history, type of job, or level of education. On the other hand, regardless of race, marriage has the major impact on household income for individuals. However, distributional differences indicated that marriage penalizes Black women. In other words, White women more consistently and twice more likely got married and their husbands had significantly higher incomes and education, which in turn penalize Black women more. Hence, both for reducing gender inequality and decreasing inequality among women, research and public policy should prioritize improving Black women's position in the labor market through emphasis on access to jobs with security and pension.

Summary prepared by Gunnur Karakurt & Shelley M. MacDermid

---

*“The pathways that lead from marriage and employment to income security are different for White and Black women. The two mechanisms do not operate the same for all women, with White women gaining more security from marriage and Black women gaining more security from “good jobs” –those with fringe benefits-to which they often lack access.”*

(P. 87)

---



---

## Family-Friendly Management in Great Britain: Testing Various Perspectives

---

S. J. Wood, L. M. de Menezes & A. Lasaosa

### ***Industrial Relations***

**Volume 42, 2003, pp. 221-250**

s.j.wood@sheffield.ac.uk

---

*“...the majority of organizations in Great Britain are at stage 1 of the work-family agenda, where the issues are largely defined in terms of mothers and child care.”*

(P. 248)

---

Family-friendly management involves a commitment by an organization to help employees fulfill both work and family obligations. Previous research in the U.S. has focused on the predictors of the adoption of family-friendly practices. The purpose of this British study was to determine whether a single dimension underlay the concept of family-friendly management, and to assess the relative importance of the major predictors of various theories.

Five perspectives have been used to explain the adoption of family-friendly practices: institutional theory (to conform to societal pressure); organizational adaptation theory (an extension of institutional theory plus the use of strategic choice by management); the high commitment perspective (to promote performance gains); the equal opportunity perspective (to remove discrimination); and the situational perspective (to adapt to local circumstances). While past studies largely have been addressed with U.S. data, this study used data from Great Britain’s Workplace Employee Relations Survey of 1998 (WERS98).

A random sample of workplaces employing 10 or more employees was stratified by workplace size and industry sector. The final sample consisted of 2191 workplaces and 28,215 participants. The family-friendly practices included information about parental leave, work at home, part-time work, job sharing, use of workplace nurseries, child care, quality circles, functional flexibility, teamwork, suggestion schemes, interpersonal skills, team briefing, and demographic information. Latent variable analysis and regression analysis were used to test the hypotheses.

The most significant finding was that family-friendly management is not an integrated phenomenon and is not used in a systematic way in Great Britain. A unidimensional pattern was found for only one type of family-friendly practice involving flexible working arrangements which was termed “family-oriented flexible management.” The extreme versions of all theories were rejected by the data. Instead, employers’ adoption of family-friendly approaches was explained by factors that encompassed all five perspectives with the organizational adaptation perspective faring best. Analysis of U.S. data suggests that family-friendly management is more developed and more integrated than in Great Britain, although still discrete from high-commitment management.

*Summary prepared by Gunnur Karakurt, Rona Schwarz & Shelley M. MacDermid*

**Honorable Mention:**  
First-Round Nominees

## 2004 Kanter Award for Excellence in Work-Family Research

---

- Apparala, M. L., Reifman, A. & Munsch, J. (2003). Cross-national comparison of attitudes toward father's and mother's participation in household tasks and child care. *Sex Roles, 48*(5-6), 189-203.
- Baltes, B. B. & Heydens-Gahir, H. A. (2003). Reduction of work-family conflict through the use of selection, optimization, and compensation behaviors. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 88*(6), 1005-1018.
- Barnett, R. C., Gareis, K. C., James, J. & Steele, J. (2003). Planning ahead: College seniors' concerns about career-marriage conflict. *Journal of Vocational Behavior, 62*, 305-319.
- Batt, R. & Valcour, M. (2003). Human resources practices as predictors of work-family outcomes and employee turnover. *Industrial Relations, 42*(2), 189-220.
- Berg, P., Kalleberg, A. L. & Applebaum, E. (2003). Balancing work and family: the role of high commitment environments. *Industrial Relations, 42*(2), 168-188.
- Blair-Loy, M. & DeHart, G. (2003). Family and career trajectories among African-American female attorneys. *Journal of Family Issues, 24*(7), 908-933.
- Blair-Loy, M. & Jacobs, J. A. (2003). Globalization, work hours, and the care deficit among stockbrokers. *Gender and Society, 17*(2), 230-249.
- Bowen, G. L., et al. (2003). Promoting the adaptation of military families: An empirical test of a community practice model. *Family Relations, 52*(1), 33-44.
- Cleveland, G. & Hyatt, D. (2003). Child care subsidies, welfare reforms, and lone mothers. *Industrial Relations, 42*(2), 251-269.
- DeGraaf, P. M. & Kalmijn, M. (2003). Alternative routes in the remarriage market: competing-risk analyses of union formation. *Social Forces, 81*(4), 1459-1498.
- Deutsch, F. M., Roksa, J. & Meeske, C. (2003). How gender counts when couples count their money. *Sex Roles, 48*(7-8), 291-304.
- Eaton, S. C. (2003). If you can use them: flexibility, policies, organizational commitment, and perceived performance. *Industrial Relations, 42*(2), 145-167.
- Febbraro, A. R. (2003). Alpha bias and beta bias in research on labour and love: the case of enhancement versus scarcity. *Feminism & Psychology, 13*(2), 201-223.
- Gareis, K. C., Barnett, R. C. & Brennan, R. T. (2003). Individual and crossover effects of work schedule fit: a within-couple analysis. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 65*, 1041-1054.
- Geurts, S. A. E., Kompier, M. A. J., Roxburgh, S. & Houtman, I. L. D. (2003). Does work-home interference mediate the relationship between workload and well-being? *Journal of Vocational Behavior, 63*(3), 532-559.
- Greenhaus, J. H. & Powell, G. N. (2003). When work and family collide: Deciding between competing role demands. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 90*, 291-303.
- Han, W. J. & Waldfogel, J. (2003). Parental leave: the impact of recent legislation on parents' leave taking. *Demography, 40*(1), 191-200.

- Hank, K. & Kreyenfeld, M. (2003). A multilevel analysis of child care and women's fertility decisions in Western Germany. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 65, 584-596.
- Hill, E. J., Martinson, V. & Ferris, M. (2003). New-concept part-time employment as a work-family adaptive strategy for women professionals with small children. *Family Relations*, 53, 282-292.
- Hu, W. Y. (2003). Marriage and economic incentives. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 38(4), 942-963.
- Jackson, A. P. (2003). Mother's employment and poor and near-poor African-American children's development: A longitudinal study. *Social Service Review*, 77(1), 92-109.
- Jahn, E. (2003). Rationale and construct validity evidence for a measure of perceived organizational family support (POFS); because purported practices may not reflect reality. *Community, Work & Family*, 6(2), 123-140.
- Johnston, D. D. & Swanson, D. H. (2003). Invisible mothers: A content analysis of motherhood ideologies and myths in magazines. *Sex Roles*, 49(1-2), 21-33.
- Kiecolt, K. J. (2003). Satisfaction with work and family life: No evidence of a cultural reversal. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 65, 23-35.
- Kossek, E. E., Huber, M. S. Q. & Lerner, J. V. (2003). Sustaining workforce inclusion and well-being of mothers on public assistance: Individual deficit and social ecology perspectives. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 62, 155-175.
- Kroska, A. (2003). Investigating gender differences in the meaning of household chores and child care. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 65, 456-473.
- Kulik, L. (2003). Morning passages from home to work among managers in Israel: Intergender differences. *Sex Roles*, 48(5-6), 205-215.
- Kulik, L. & Rayyan, F. (2003). Wage-earning patterns, perceived division of domestic labor, and social support: A comparative analysis of educated Jewish and Arab-Muslim Israelis. *Sex Roles*, 48(1-2), 53-66.
- Lan, P. C. (2003). Negotiating social boundaries and private zones: The micropolitics and employing migrant domestic workers. *Social Problems*, 50(4), 525-549.
- Lee, C. & Iverson-Gilbert, J. (2003). Demand, support, and perception in family-related stress among Protestant clergy. *Family Relations*, 52(3), 249-257.
- Lim, V. K. G. & Leng Loo, G. (2003). Effects of parental job insecurity and parenting behaviors on youths' self-efficacy and work attitudes. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 63(1), 86-98.
- Orange, R. M. (2003). The emerging mutable self: Gender dynamics and creative adaptations in defining work, family, and the future. *Social Forces*, 82(1), 1-34.
- Paul, J. J., Winter, M., Miller, N. J. & Fitzgerald, M. A. (2003). Cross-constitutional norms for timing and sequencing and the use of adjustment strategies in families affiliated with family-owned businesses. *Marriage & Family Review*, 35(1-2), 167-191.
- Perrons, D. (2003). The new economy and the work-life balance: Conceptual explorations and a case study of new media. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 10(1), 65-93.

- Powers, E. T. (2003). Children's health and maternal work activity. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 38(3), 522-556.
- Presser, H. B. (2003). Race-ethnic and gender differences in nonstandard work shifts. *Work and Occupations*, 30(4), 412-439.
- Shore, L. M., Cleveland, J. N. & Goldberg, C. B. (2003). Work attitudes and decisions as a function of manager age and employee age. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 88(3), 529-537.
- Southworth, C. & Stepan-Norris, J. (2003). The geography of class in an industrial American city: Connections between workplace and neighborhood politics. *Social Problems*, 50(3), 319-347.
- Wheelock, J., Oughton, E. & Baines, S. (2003). Getting by with a little help from your family: Toward a policy-relevant model of the household. *Feminist Economics*, 9(1), 19-45.
- Zuo, J. (2003). From revolutionary comrades to gendered partners. *Journal of Family Issues*, 24(3), 314-337.

## Award Procedures

---

### Structure of the Review Committee

The committee is chaired by Shelley M. MacDermid, Professor and Director of the Center for Families at Purdue University, and Director of the Midwestern Work-Family Association. During 2004, 44 reviewers from eight countries participated in selecting the Kanter winners. Reviewers are invited to serve by the committee chair, using a variety of criteria. For example, reviewers are selected to represent a variety of scientific fields and institutions. International representation is desirable. Each year, nominees and winners from the prior year are invited to serve on the committee. Volunteers are invited to apply to join the committee via work-family networks and listservs. Both junior and advanced scholars are invited to serve, but most members are senior scholars with long publication records. Membership on the committee rotates on a staggered cycle of approximately three years.

### Journals Reviewed

Articles in 52 journals were reviewed. The selection of journals was guided using four sources: an empirical study by Bob Drago identifying where most of the work-family literature appears, the journals most frequently appearing in the citation database developed by the Sloan Work-Family Researchers' Network, and an informal survey of leading researchers about the journals they regularly read. Members of the review panel are also surveyed each year about journals they recommend adding to the list.

### Qualifying Articles

The Kanter award is given to the authors of the best work-family research article published during a calendar year. No external nominations are accepted for the award. Instead, every article published in a large number of peer-reviewed scientific journals is scrutinized. The articles must be data-based and innovative (i.e., not summaries of existing research). Both qualitative and quantitative analyses are eligible.

### Initial Pool of Nominees

Each reviewer was responsible for examining all articles published during the 2003 calendar year in three to five scientific journals. Each journal was examined by at least two reviewers, who nominated the articles they felt were deserving candidates for the Kanter award. Reviewers also were encouraged to nominate articles that they knew about through other sources.

### Second Round

Each of the 60 nominated articles was sent to two reviewers, who scored it according to several standard criteria. The total scores were used to select the Kanter Top 20; the top five articles became finalists for the award.

### Final Round

In the final round, all reviewers scored each of the finalist articles to determine the winner. After the winners were chosen, reviewers were asked (as they are each year) to recommend revisions to the award process for the 2004 award.

## Members of the Kanter Award Committee — 2004

---

Shelley M. MacDermid, Chair

### ***Child Development and Family Studies*** **Purdue University**

Tammy Allen	University of South Florida
Joyce Altobelli	University of Minnesota
Stella Anderson	Appalachian State University
Barbara Arrighi	Northern Kentucky University
Manfred Auer	Institute of Organization and Learning, Austria
Lotte Bailyn	MIT-Sloan School of Management
Anne Bardoel	Monash University, Australia
S. J. Behson	Samuel J. Silberman College of Business
Deepti Bhatnagar	Indian Institute of Management, India
Michelle Budig	University of Massachusetts
Maria Charles	University of California, San Diego
Jan Cleveland	Penn State University
Karen Crooker	University of Wisconsin-Parkside
Emma Dentiger	University of Massachusetts-Boston
Rebecca Erickson	University of Akron
Anita Garey	University of Connecticut
Jeffrey Greenhaus	Drexel University
Ted Greenstein	North Carolina State University
Linda Haas	Indiana University
Brad Harrington	Boston College
Joni Hersch	Harvard Law School
Susan Hinze	Case Western Reserve University
Gayle Kaufman	Davidson College
Karen Korabik	University of Guelph, Canada
Donna Lero	University of Guelph, Canada
Shelley MacDermid	Purdue University
Ross MacMillan	University of Minnesota
Sue Falter Mennino	Loyola University-New Orleans
Phyllis Moen	University of Minnesota
Robert Perrucci	Purdue University
Patricia Raskin	Columbia University
Patricia Roehling	Hope College
Jackie Krasas Rogers	Penn State University
John Sandberg	McGill University
Margaret Shaffer	Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong
Cath Sullivan	University of Central Lancashire, UK
Stephen Sweet	Ithaca College
Maximiliane Szinovacz	Eastern Virginia Medical School
K. G. Tijdens	Amsterdam University, the Netherlands
Thomas Vander Ven	University of Cincinnati
Joan Williams	Washington College of Law
Carrie Yodanis	University of British Columbia, Canada
Anisa Zvonkovic	Oregon State University
Yvonne Zylan	Pillsbury Winthrop

## Journals Reviewed

---

Academy of Management Journal	Journal of Health and Social Behavior
Academy of Management Review	Journal of Management
Administrative Science Quarterly	Journal of Marriage and Family
American Journal of Sociology	Journal of Occupational Health
American Sociological Review	Psychology Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology
Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences	Journal of Organizational Behavior
Canadian Journal on Aging	Journal of Personality and Social Psychology
Canadian Journal of Sociology	Journal of Vocational Behavior
Canadian Psychology	Marriage and Family Review
Community, Work, and Family	Monthly Labor Review
Demography	Personnel Psychology
Family Relations	Psychology of Women Quarterly
Families in Society	Qualitative Sociology
Feminist Economics	Research on Aging
Gender and Society	Research on Social Work Practice
Gender, Work and Organizations	Sex Roles
Human Relations	Signs
Human Resource Management	Social Forces
Industrial and Labor Relations Review	Social Problems
Industrial Relations	Social Service Review
Journal of Aging Studies	Social Work
Journal of Applied Psychology	Social Work Research
Journal of Family and Economic Issues	Sociological Forum
Journal of Family Issues	Work and Occupations
Journals of Gerontology	Work and Stress
The Gerontologist	

## The Center for Families at Purdue University

---

The Center for Families works to strengthen the capacity of families to provide nurturing environments for their members. The Center promotes decision-making that is both informed by rigorous research and responsive to families' needs, and works to make such research available, accessible, and understandable; develops innovative ways to enhance the quality of life of children and families; and creates and nurtures collaborations for change to improve the quality of life for families and children. Primary audiences for the Center's work are educators, human service professionals, employers, and policymakers. The Center is home to **The Midwestern Work-Family Association**, a membership organization interested in family issues that offers employers of all sizes opportunities to address -- individually and collectively -- challenges confronting today's workplaces around issues of work and family.

## The Boston College Center for Work & Family

---

Founded in 1990, the Boston College Center for Work & Family is committed to enhancing the quality of life of today's work force by providing leadership for the integration of work and life, an essential for business and community success. The Center's vision is that companies and communities will work together to ensure their mutual prosperity and the well-being of employees and their families. The Center is home to two corporate partnerships. **The Work & Family Roundtable** is a national membership organization of 45 employers committed to excellence in work/life with the mission to provide leadership to shape responses to the demands of work, home, and community in order to enhance employee effectiveness. **The New England Work & Family Association (NEWFA)** is the Center's local New England partnership with a mission to foster collaborations to create and sustain employer work/life programs that effectively meet both employee and business needs, and to build more productive, healthier workplaces for employers, employees, families, and the community.

## Alliance for Work-Life Progress

---

Alliance for Work-Life Progress (AWLP) is the leading not-for-profit professional association committed to the development and advancement of the field of work-life effectiveness. Founded in 1996, AWLP strives to improve the professionalism of those working in the work-life arena and influence better integration of work and family life. AWLP also addresses work-life issues through publications, forums, surveys, and as an education provider, including certificate courses. An affiliate organization of WorldatWork, AWLP has its headquarters in Scottsdale, Arizona.







**Published by**

Purdue University  
Center for Families  
School of Consumer and Family Sciences  
1200 West State Street  
West Lafayette, IN 47907-2055  
Phone: (765) 494-9878  
Fax: (765) 494-0503  
E-mail: [cff@cfs.purdue.edu](mailto:cff@cfs.purdue.edu)  
Web site: [www.cfs.purdue.edu/cff](http://www.cfs.purdue.edu/cff)

Boston College  
Center for Work & Family  
22 Stone Avenue  
Chestnut Hill, MA 02467  
Phone: (617) 552-2844  
Fax: (617) 552-2859  
E-mail: [cwf@bc.edu](mailto:cwf@bc.edu)  
Web site: [www.bc.edu/cwf](http://www.bc.edu/cwf)